

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE EDINA PLANNING COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, MAY 30, 2001, 7:30 P.M.
EDINA CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS
4801 WEST 50TH STREET**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

**Chair, Gordon Johnson, John Lonsbury, Ann Swenson, David Byron,
Helen McClelland, David Runyan, Charles Ingwalson, and Geoffrey
Workinger**

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Lorelei Bergman

STAFF PRESENT:

Craig Larsen, Joyce Repya and Jackie Hoogenakker

OTHERS PRESENT:

Robert Vogel, Robert Vogel and Association

I. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:

The minutes of the March 28, 2001, meeting were filed as submitted.

II. OLD BUSINESS:

**Z-01-1 Edward and Lisa Noonan
 5400 France Avenue South**

Mr. Larsen told the Commission at the May 1, 2001, Council Meeting Edward and Lisa Noonan received preliminary rezoning approval. PCD-4, Planned Commercial District-4 to PCD-1, Planned Commercial District-1. Mr. Larsen said at this time the proponents are requesting final rezoning.

Mr. Larsen concluded staff recommends final rezoning subject to a landscaping plan and Landscaping Bond.

The proponent, Mr. Ed Noonan was present to respond to questions.

Chairman Johnson asked Mr. Larsen if landscaping is required on the west side of the property. Mr. Larsen said ordinance does not require landscaping in that area.

Commissioner Workinger asked Mr. Larsen if he believes the landscaping along the south property line is adequate. Mr. Larsen said the landscaping along the south property line meets code, but the Commission can recommend more landscaping in that area if desired.

Mr. Noonan interjected along the southern property line there are some evergreens, scrub trees, and grass. He told the Commission the entire site will be cleaned and cleared of dead brush and trees, and replanting and reseeding will occur.

Commissioner Runyan asked Mr. Noonan if he would use the existing pylon sign. Mr. Noonan said he is not planning to use the existing pylon sign. Commissioner Workinger interjected and asked Mr. Noonan if he would be willing to remove the pylon sign. Mr. Noonan said he is willing to remove the pylon sign.

Commissioner Swenson asked Mr. Larsen if parking requirements are met. Mr. Larsen said parking complies with City Code.

Commissioner Ingwalson moved to recommend final rezoning approval subject to receipt of a landscaping plan and bond. Commissioner Runyan seconded the motion. All voted aye; motion carried.

S-01-2 & Z-01-2 Comprehensive Plan	JMS Equities and Thorpe Real Estate 6512 Vernon Avenue
---	---

Mr. Larsen informed the Council at their May 1, 2001, meeting met and approved a revised plan. The original proposal contained 13 units, with nine units fronting on a new cul de sac, and four units fronting on Tamarac Avenue. The plan approved by the City Council removed one of the lots on Tamarac Avenue. Mr. Larsen said no additional changes were ordered by Council.

Mr. Larsen concluded staff recommends amending the Comprehensive Plan, and final rezoning and final plat approval conditioned on:

1. Developers Agreement
2. Subdivision Dedication based on a raw land value of \$722,000.00.
3. Watershed District Permits
4. Modification of landscaping plan to meet ordinance requirements, plus landscaping bond.

The proponent, Mr. Schoenwetter was present to respond to questions.

Commissioner Swenson asked Mr. Larsen if he anticipates any problems with parking on Sunday mornings. Mr. Larsen said to date the City has not received any negative reports on parking at this site.

Commissioner Swenson asked Mr. Larsen if he believes guest parking is adequate. Mr. Larsen said guest parking would occur on the street and in the driveways, similar to other residential neighborhoods where a church is present.

Commissioner McClelland noted the church and church membership is not large, adding she does not believe parking will be an issue.

Commissioner Ingwolson asked Mr. Schoenwetter if the prices vary between the proposed homes on Tamarac Avenue and on the cul-de-sac. Mr. Schoenwetter responded the base price for all buildings will be the same. Added amenities, and square footage will change the price of each unit. Mr. Schoenwetter said he believes the average price of the homes will be in the 400 thousand plus range.

Commissioner McClelland moved to recommend final rezoning, final plat and amendment to the Comprehensive Plan subject to:

1. Developers Agreement
2. Subdivision Dedication based on a raw land value of \$722,000.00
3. Watershed District Permits
4. Modification of landscaping plan to meet ordinance requirements, plus landscaping bond.

Commissioner Lonsbury seconded the motion. All voted aye; motion carried.

III. OTHER BUSINESS:

Country Club District Demolition Permit Moratorium

Mr. Larsen informed the Commission Members of the Heritage Preservation Board have recommended a six-month moratorium on teardowns within the historic Country Club District. Mr. Larsen stressed the recommendation for a moratorium in no way reflects a problem. The goal of the moratorium is to ensure there are no weaknesses in the present code as it relates to teardowns, and to protect the historic integrity of the district.

Mr. Larsen introduced Ms. Repya city staff liaison to the Heritage Preservation Board and Mr. Robert Vogel, of Robert C. Vogel & Associates, preservation planning consultant.

Commissioner Runyan asked Mr. Larsen Mr. Vogel's role in the moratorium. Mr. Larsen explained in the up-coming months Mr. Vogel will work with city staff and members of the Heritage Preservation Board as they re-visit city code. Together they will formulate guidelines for the district.

Commissioner Ingwalson asked Mr. Larsen the role the Planning Commission plays in the moratorium.

Mr. Larsen explained the Heritage Preservation Board advises the Planning Commission and in turn the Planning Commission advises the Council. Mr. Larsen said at this time the Heritage Preservation Board is asking the Commission to consider recommending to the City Council a six-month moratorium on demolition permits in the Country Club District. This moratorium will allow city planning staff and advisory commissions time to examine how to best approach teardowns in the district.

Commissioner McClelland referred to a copy of a "Country Club Survey" she received in her Commission packet and asked Mr. Larsen when the survey will be mailed to the Country Club residents. Mr. Larsen said he believes the survey will be mailed to Country Club residents after the moratorium is in place.

Mr. Vogel addressed the Commission and informed them the main reason for requesting a moratorium is to grant time to study the teardown issue and develop a land use strategy before another teardown is requested. Continuing, Mr. Vogel informed the Commission in the 1920's Edina was a small village. During this time the concept of the Country Club District was developed as a planned community with sidewalks, compatible streetscapes, and tree lined streets. Building restrictions for the planned district also included criteria for size, value, scale and architectural style.

Commissioner Ingwalson told the Commission he has opinions on teardowns within the Country Club District, and is concerned more might occur without proper supervision. He explained he is a long time resident of the district, and one concern he has is that the people making decisions for the district might not live in the district. Commissioner Ingwalson acknowledged to date the two sites where teardowns have occurred have resulted in new homes that meet the character of the Country Club District. Concluding, Commissioner Ingwalson said any future "committee" would need to be careful in placing restraints on individual homes, and if it is deemed appropriate for a committee to review house plans maybe those individuals should come from the district.

Commissioner McClelland referred to question #7 on the Survey form and recommended that question be changed to read, "Please list any other comments or suggestions you have about the Country Club District". She said in her opinion that reads "more friendly".

Commissioner Swenson asked who the members of the Heritage Preservation Board are. Mr. Larsen explained members of the Heritage Preservation Board are appointed by the Mayor, are Edina residents, and have an interest in Heritage Preservation.

Commissioner Lonsbury said he understands the focus of the moratorium is on the Country Club District, and its historic significance, adding in his opinion there may be other neighborhoods in the City that warrant consideration. Commissioner Lonsbury said, as he understands the Country Club District the "District" is on the "National Register of Historic Places" but not individual houses in the district. He commented it might be difficult to isolate individual houses. Concluding, Commissioner Lonsbury agreed with staff that presently there appears to be no problem. The District polices itself well.

Chairman Johnson asked if this request would go before Council. Mr. Larsen said if the Commission recommends a temporary moratorium it will move forward to City Council.

Commissioner Byron said he has some reservations on a limited area moratorium because it does not include the entire City. Commissioner Byron said he understands members of the Heritage Preservation Board are only concerned with the Country Club District, but in his opinion since no problems have been recorded it might be better if a moratorium on demolition permits encompasses the entire City. Concluding, Commissioner Byron asked if the final goal is for a positive collective guide policy for the entire city or just the Country Club District.

Mr. Vogel said at this time the focus is on the Country Club District. Mr. Vogel explained residents in that district already realize their homes are located in a historic district. Mr. Vogel said the City has exhibited a commitment to historic preservation that goes back almost thirty years.

Mr. Larsen said he understands issues expressed by Commissioners this evening and explained with the moratorium the City is being pro-active, he reiterated a problem does not exist, but the City is committed to preservation of the district.

Commissioner Ingwalson acknowledged as a resident of the district there has been no negative reaction regarding the two teardowns, however within the district a level of concern exists.

A discussion ensued with Commissioners in agreement a moratorium may be warranted.

Commissioner McClelland asked Mr. Vogel if he believes six months is long enough to address the teardown issue. Mr. Vogel stated in his opinion six months is adequate to develop an appropriate land use strategy for the historic district. Continuing, Mr. Vogel said it is important to recognize the historic significance of the Country Club District, adding it is one of the first planned neighborhoods in the Country.

Mr. Bill Horn, resident of the Country Club District, told the Commission there is an element of concern in the district regarding teardowns.

Commissioner Lonsbury moved to recommend at the request of the Heritage Preservation Board a six-month moratorium on demolition permits for principal structures within the Country Club District. Commissioner McClelland seconded the motion.

Commissioner Workinger commented in his opinion the motion made this evening is good, but he is worried about the exclusiveness of the motion. Commissioner Byron agreed focusing on just one area in the City is tough to sort out, but the Heritage Preservation Board and staff support the request for moratorium and I will agree with that request.

Commissioner Ingwalson said as a resident of the district I have concerns, but believe at this time I should abstain from the vote

Ayes, Lonsbury, Swenson, McClelland, Runyan, Johnson. Nay, Workinger. Abstain, Ingwalson. Motion carried.

IV. ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 9:15. P.M.

Jackie Hoogenakker