

MINUTES
Annual Meeting of the
Edina Heritage Preservation Board
Edina City Hall – Community Room
Tuesday, April 9, 2013
7:00 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER 7:05 P.M.

II. ROLL CALL

Answering roll call were Members Moore, Christiaansen, Sussman, O'Brien, McDermott, Weber, Johnson, Good, and Holtan. Absent was Members Davis who had submitted his resignation from the Board prior to the meeting. Staff present was Senior Planner, Joyce Repya.

III. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Planner Repya called for nominations for the office of Chairman of the HPB. Member Mellom suggested Member Moore for nomination. Mr. Moore agreed that he would be willing to serve. No other members were offered for nomination, thus Member Mellom moved that Member Moore serve as Chairman of the HPB for the coming year. Member McDermott seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

Nominations or volunteers for the office of Vice Chair were then requested. There were no nominations offered, however Member Mellom volunteered to serve as Vice Chair. Member Christiaansen then moved to appoint Member Mellom to serve as Vice Chair of the HPB for the coming year. Member McDermott seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

The HPB thanked Members Moore and Mellom for agreeing to take on the leadership roles.

IV. APPROVAL OF MEETING AGENDA

Planner Repya advised the board that item #VII.A. 2. 4633 Drexel Avenue – Sketch Plan Review had been withdrawn. Member O'Brien moved to approve the meeting agenda with the deletion of item #VIII.A. 2. Member Mellom seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

V. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES March 12, 2013

Member O'Brien moved to approve the minutes from the March 12, 2013 meeting. Member McDermott seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

VI. COMMUNITY COMMENT - None

VII. REPORTS & RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Certificates of Appropriateness

I. H-13-3 4515 Browndale Avenue - Build a detached garage in the northeast Corner of the rear yard, and convert an attached garage to living space

Planner Repya reported that the subject property is located in the northeast corner of Browndale Avenue and Bridge Street. The existing home, a Colonial Revival style constructed in 1935, currently has a single story 3-car attached garage accessed by a driveway on the south side of the property on Bridge Street.

The Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) request entails the construction of a new detached garage in the northeast corner of the rear yard. The plans also include reducing the size of the attached garage and converting it to living space.

The proposed 736 square foot 3-car detached garage measures 21' 8" x 34' feet in area. A service door and window are provided on the west elevation, and 2 windows are shown on the north elevation. Access to the garage will be obtained through 3 single overhead doors on the south elevation from Bridge Street. A new curb cut and driveway from Bridge Street is proposed to accommodate the easterly placement of the new garage. The creation of a new easterly curb cut will require the existing curb cut be removed. Ms. Repya added that the design of the structure is proposed to compliment the style of the home with brick cladding on the walls and an asphalt shingled roof. The height of the garage is shown to be 19' 6" at the highest peak. The height at the mid-point of the gable is shown to be 14' 6", and a height of 9'6" is provided at the eave line. The hip roof is designed with a 10/12 pitch, complementing the hip roof of the home. All dimensions for the proposed structure are consistent with the surrounding detached garages as well as the three stall garages previously approved by the HPB through the COA process.

The proposed location of the garage is 4.5' from the south and west property lines to accommodate the soffit overhang setback of 3 feet.

Ms. Repya pointed out that because the subject property is a corner lot, the conversion of the garage to living space is visible from a street facing façade (Bridge Street) requiring a review of the plans as part of the COA. The new space has been designed to provide a compatible use of the home while at the same time maintain the home's overall historic character. The square footage of the existing 672 sq. ft. attached garage space will be reduced for the conversion to living space to ensure that the total footprint of the structures on the lot does not exceed the 25% maximum allowed by the Zoning Ordinance. (The existing lot coverage is 21%, and the proposed lot coverage will be 25%).

Ms. Repya added that a side yard setback variance is required due to a non-conforming side yard setback from the north property line for the garage conversion to living space. It has been the policy for projects requiring both a COA and a variance to first receive the COA; and once approved then move on to the Planning Commission for consideration of the variance request. The proposed detached garage complies with the required setback criteria and will not be subject to the variance.

Ms. Repya further explained that Preservation Consultant Robert Vogel provided a written opinion of the proposed plans in which he explained that the design of the proposed new garage meets the general standards for new construction in the Country Club District plan of treatment. The plans submitted with the COA application describe a structure that appears to be compatible in size, scale, building materials, and texture with the historic house. The contemporary design is consistent with the standards for rehabilitation because it is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property and the surrounding neighborhood. He added that the proposed new garage will not have an adverse effect on the historical significance and integrity of the property or the district as a whole; thus he recommended approval.

Regarding the proposed conversion of the attached garage to living space, Mr. Vogel's written observations pointed out that the plans meet the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation and the design review guidelines of the district plan of treatment. The new addition will be visible from Bridge Street thus included in the COA review. The demolition of attached garages is considered appropriate in the Country Club District when the alteration makes possible an efficient contemporary use of the property while preserving those architectural features which are significant to its historical and architectural values. The plans presented demonstrate that no significant architectural character defining features of the home will be destroyed; and when the project is completed, the house will retain its distinguishing historical qualities. Mr. Vogel added that he was pleased to see that the applicant proposes to minimize the size and visual impact of the new addition. The plans submitted with the COA application show an addition that is compatible in scale, materials, and texture with the rest of the house; thus approval of the garage conversion to living space was also recommended.

Planner Repya concluded that she concurred with Consultant Vogel's evaluation of the proposed improvements to the property, noting that the detached garage is consistent with new garages previously reviewed in the district and conversion of the attached garage to living space will blend in well with the historic façade of the home; thus, she too recommended approval of the COA request.

Findings supporting the recommendation included:

- The plans provided with subject request clearly illustrate the scale and scope of the proposed projects.
- The proposed detached garage will complement the architectural style of the home and not be detrimental to the adjacent historic structures.
- The addition to the home visible from Bridge Street will preserve the structure's significant architectural character defining features and retain its distinguishing historical qualities.
- The information provided supporting the subject COA meets the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance and the Country Club District Plan of Treatment.

Ms. Repya also recommended the following conditions for approval:

- Subject to the plans presented; and
- The placement of a year built plaque on the exterior of the new detached garage.

Architect, Jean Rehkamp Larson was present to represent the applicant.

Member Christiaansen asked for clarification of the variance required and whether the homeowner had considered an alternative plan that would not require a variance. Ms. Rehkamp Larson explained that the variance is required because the existing home currently has a non-conforming side yard setback, and there would be no way to redesign the existing attached garage to living space without obtaining a variance.

Ms. Christiaansen also inquired about the amount of impervious space that would be provided with the proposed plan. Ms. Rehkamp Larson explained that the existing driveway/curb cut will be removed and the proposed plans will include a walkway from the detached garage to the rear of the home with a grassy area, and a small patio within the lot coverage allowance.

Member Mellom asked if the proposed plan would require the loss of any boulevard trees. Ms. Rehkamp Larson explained that there is a boulevard tree along Bridge Street that will not be adversely compromised by the proposed project. She added that the arborvitae hedge along Bridge Street will be removed to provide for the new driveway.

A brief discussion ensued among the board - members expressing how much they liked the project, agreeing that it is sensitive to the subject home as well as its surroundings.

Member Mellom then moved approval of the COA subject to the plans presented and a year built plaque be displayed on the exterior of the detached garage. Member Weber seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

2. 4633 Drexel Avenue – Sketch Plan Review WITHDRAWN

B. Edina Heritage Award

Member Mellom reminded the board that she and student members Sarah Good and Nathan Johnson had agreed to take on the task of reviewing the 2013 Heritage Award nominations and recommending an award recipient for consideration by the HPB. Ms. Mellom pointed out that the two following nominations were received:

#1 6601 France Avenue – Southdale Center

Submitted by Robert L. Moore, HPB Member

SUMMARY: Simon Properties has recently completed a massive \$19.1 million renovation on Southdale Center. Gone are all the dated teal and gray colors of the 1990s and back in place are many of the wonderful mid-century aspects that harken back to the era during which the center was built. Stone flooring, wood finishes on columns, ceilings, and railings, wonderful light fixtures, and inviting seating areas are back and it all looks phenomenal.

#2 W. 44th Street (North side – France Ave. west to HWY 100)

Submitted by JC Beckstrand

SUMMARY: The north side of West 44th Street is one of Edina's most significant historic streets with architecturally important homes that date from 1869 through the 1930's.....The homeowners have in many cases worked diligently to maintain the historic integrity of the homes and neighborhood where the streets are named for some of the important people that played a role in the development of a community that includes parts of Morningside, Grimes Homestead and Browndale Park.

Ms. Mellom pointed out that both nominations were very well written and either would make a worthy recipient. However, because the HPB has been working to recognize the original Mid-Century Modern artwork still existing at Southdale; and one of the initiatives in the HPB 2013 work plan includes the task of working with Southdale Center to recognize the significance of the nation's first enclosed shopping mall, the committee agreed that choosing Southdale Center for the 2013 Heritage Award recipient would be a very timely choice.

Discussion ensued amongst the board regarding the merits of both nominations. Member Holtan asked if there could be two recipients of the award. Planner Repya explained that the HPB had discussed that potential in previous years and agreed to limit the award to one property each year. However, she added that just because a nomination is not chosen one year, does not prevent the board from adding that nomination into the contention as a recipient in upcoming years – that is exactly what occurred with the Heritage Award to St. Stephen's Church in 2011. The nomination for the church was originally received in a previous year.

Member McDermott pointed out that presenting the Heritage Award to Southdale would be very timely considering the upcoming PBS special "Ten Buildings that Changed America".

Following a brief discussion, Member Mellom moved to present the 2013 Heritage Award to Southdale Center. Member McDermott seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried. At the request of the board, Planner Repya agreed to send a letter of thanks to the person who nominated the properties on the north side of 44th Street – encouraging them to stay engaged with heritage preservation in Edina.

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

A. May 2013 – Preservation Month "See! Save! Celebrate!"

Planner Repya reported that the planned activities celebrating Preservation Month included a City Council Proclamation celebrating "See! Save! Celebrate!"; as well as the Heritage Award presentation to Southdale Center - both to take place at the May 7th City Council meeting.

Board members discussed expanding the typical Preservation Month activities from the month of May to the entire year since Edina was celebrating its Quasquicentennial and many activities

are being planned throughout the year. Chair Moore pointed out that typically the HPB has joined with the Edina Historical Society (EHS) to provide an open house at the Cahill School and Grange Hall during the month of May, however historically this event has not been well attended. That being said, the July 4th open house of the buildings has always been very successful, thus perhaps the HPB could join the EHS in promoting the tour of the buildings at that time.

The board continued to brainstorm ideas of promoting heritage preservation in the community. It was agreed that utilizing the City's web site and Facebook page could go a long way to engage the public and spur interest in the HPB's mission. Planner Repya pointed out that the City's Communication Department has been very supportive of the HPB's desires to promote HPB activities and initiatives through not only the City's web site, but also the *About Town* magazine and *Agenda Edina* cable show. The board agreed that they will continue the discussion of creating innovative ways to promote the City's heritage preservation program. No formal action was taken.

IX. CORRESPONDENCE & PETITIONS None

X. CHAIR AND BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

Member Sussman commented that the re-roofing of the Cahill School and Grange Hall has been completed and he wanted to commend the Park Department and the contractor on a job well done. Fellow board members agreed with Member Sussman.

XI. STAFF COMMENTS

Planner Repya reported that the annual Minnesota Historic Preservation Conference will be held in Lanesboro, MN on September 12 & 13. Because Edina is a CLG (Certified Local Government) city, we are required to send at least one member to the conference. Fortunately, the CLG program provides scholarship funds to pay for the registration and lodging, however the funds are available on a first come/first serve basis – consequently, she encouraged board members to check the dates to determine if they would be able to attend. The reservation process begins in mid-summer, and she promised to keep the board advised.

Member Sussman encouraged board members to consider attending the conference - adding that he attended the 2012 conference in Fergus Falls and found it to be well worthwhile.

XII. NEXT MEETING DATE May 14, 2013

XIII. ADJOURNMENT 8:00 p.m.

Edina Heritage Preservation Board

Minutes

April 9, 2013

Member Mellom moved for adjournment at 8:00 p.m. Member Weber seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

Respectfully submitted,
Joyce Repya